

## Minutes of the Project Board Meeting

Project ID #00071121

“Development of capacities of the National Human Rights Institutions in Uzbekistan”

**Date:** December 21, 2009  
**Time:** 12:00 – 13:30  
**Venue:** The Project Office

### Present:

AU Ms. Aziza Umarova, Head of GGU  
BA Mr. Bekhzod Aliev, Project Manager  
MT Ms. Marina Ten, Programme Specialist  
KR Ms. Komila Rakhimova, Gender Specialist  
EA Mr. Evgeniy Abdullaev, Legal Research Coordinator  
KsR Ms. Kseniya Rijkova, Task Manager on Legal Aid and Legal Clinic Education  
DA Ms. Dilnora Azimova, Educational Coordinator  
IT Ms. Irina Tsoy, Component Assistant  
IS Mr. Ilhom Soliev, Project Assistant (minutes)

### *Meeting opened*

BA Gave a brief background of the progress and achievements made in accordance with set annual targets for 2009. Proposed to have more detailed discussions on each activity (See the Annex I).

AU Asked BA to update on the follow up related to the implementation of the National Action Plan (with reference to e-mail from UN RC to UN Agencies).

BA Informed that the trainings for judges/prosecutors were postponed till 2010 and would be conducted in cooperation with the Research Center at the Supreme Court of Uzbekistan.

EA Suggested that the module for these trainings should be developed by the respective competent national consultants.

AU Proposed to involve a pilot court/courts to have a possibility to monitor and analyze the situation on implementation of the habeas corpus by lawyers not only with qualitative but also quantitative data.

BA Explained that according to the legislation of Uzbekistan, only an accused with his/her legal representative can participate in the process which makes the idea of direct monitoring impossible.

- KsR While presenting and discussing the Target within the Activity 2, made a remark that by now, only two Legal Clinics (LC) – SHAM and partially the LC at Namangan State University - have the capacity to proceed with criminal cases.
- BA Continued presenting the achievements and noted that over 2,500 people have gone through various trainings at the 6 regional resource centers within the Activity 3. In response to the question from AU whether or not those training were on human rights related issues, stated that most of them were integrated with different aspects of human rights issues such as gender, environment, etc. Informed that Legal Research Coordinator, Task Manager on Legal Aid and Legal Clinic Education and Educational Coordinator of the Project are working on reporting forms that can be applied for systematic and disaggregated reporting.
- KR Reminded that where possible, all data should be disaggregated by sex.
- BA Confirmed that data presented can be and will be disaggregated by sex as well. Finished on Targets 2009 and moved on for presenting and discussing achievements of each activity (see the Annex I).
- MT Suggested including achievements on the draft law on Free Legal Aid into Target achievements.
- AU Supported MT and proposed to consider making at least a rough calculation of expenses related to implementation of the proposed law on Free Legal Aid so that process of reviewing it by respective government entities can be fostered.
- BA Noted that it should be taken into consideration that in case the calculation will give impressive figures, it may repulse government officials in advance without fully considering the draft law itself.
- EA Made a point of a possibility to distribute ordered books on human rights for counterparts during an organized event where counterparts can meet one another and share ideas and plans on project related issues.
- MT Supported EA, and proposed that it could be a good chance to organize an extended project board meeting.
- BA Followed the presentation with the achievements within the Activity 2 (see the Annex I).
- KsR Informed that Ms. Nilufar Kurbanova has been assigned to the position of a head of the LC at the Tashkent State Law Institute which is a good news since she is both a very active and willing to work in the field and open for cooperation with the Project.
- BA Followed the presentation with the achievements within the Activity 3 (see the Annex I).

- DA Shared a success story about a volunteering teacher who demonstrated willingness to instruct on NORMA for resource center users in Zaamin.
- BA Shifted to the draft targets and plans for 2010.
- MT Proposed to make necessary adjustments to the targets since some of them can be combined (under Target 1 and Target 3), and some are already achieved (under Target 2), thus, noted, that other relevant Targets should be set.
- AU Agreed with MT, and proposed to develop an interactive internet resource (web-site) for consultation purposes where everyone can ask questions on Human Rights and find relevant documentation or seek an answer to the questions.
- EA Added to point raised by AU, sharing that particularly the Ombudsman's Office receives a big deal of questions and needs assistance in responding them – where this proposed web-site could be very helpful.
- AU In response to the concern raised by KsR, stated that a special service agreement can be concluded to maintain the web-site and that the future ToRs of the tutors at LCs should include active participation in responding to the questions posted on the web-site. Then, while discussing the plans to conduct trainings with the Ministry of Internal Affairs, Legal Training Center under MoJ and Chamber of Advocates asked to pay a special attention that trainings should carry a UNDP contribution not only financially but importantly in terms of the content.
- BA Supported AU and also noted that there is a need to recruit a specialist who will be more closely working on Activity 1 since this component will have an increased workload in 2010.
- AU Agreed with BA and suggested to recruit a specialist who might assist not only with the Activity 1 but also with the entire project if needed.
- BA One more time thanked and congratulated colleagues with the fundraising achievement from the Czech Fund administered by UNDP BRC.
- AU Made a remark to make sure that as many as possible representatives from the counterparts should have an opportunity to exchange knowledge and raise respective skills within the mentioned extra fund of the project. While discussing the plans within the Activity 3, proposed to establish a resource center based in Tashkent and shift current component assistant - IT as a site administrator to that center in order to optimize human resources of the project and increase the impact of the project in the capital.

MT Reminded to keep in mind, in case Van Breda, ISS and other costs for the fourth quarter were not charged this year, then sufficient funds should be allocated in AWP 2010 to cover the costs.

BA Thanked everyone for the contribution and closed the meeting.

*Meeting closed*

Prepared by: Ilhom Soliev



Cleared by:

Aziza Umarova

Head of GGU, UNDP Uzbekistan



Bekhzod Aliev

Project Manager #00071121



December 21, 2009

## Annex I. Draft report for the Project Board Meeting prepared by Mr. Bekhzod Aliev, Project Manager

### Targets 2009

1. *Capacity of the Government on implementation of National Action Plan on UPR built; implementation of habeas corpus by lawyers is supported through training for judges and prosecutors.*

- a roundtable to present the NAP on implementing recommendations made after Uzbekistan's UPR report was held on November 11. Although the NAP has been developed without participation from UNDP, we believe we can take active participation in implementing some of the activities listed by the NAP and have tried to involve other UN agencies operation in Uzbekistan to also take part in its implementation.

- no trainings for judges or prosecutors were conducted as we were asked by our national counterparts to postpone this for 2010.

2. *Two new legal clinics in the regions are established and staff trained; legal advice (including those on the consumers' rights) are regularly provided through central and local newspapers and other media outlets.*

- during 2009 new legal clinics have been established under the law faculties of Karakalpak and Namangan State Universities. Legal advice through media was provided on ad hoc basis, namely SHAM has answered readers' questions and gave legal advice through "Mir Novostey", "Lady" and "Vecherniy Tashkent" newspapers.

3. *At least 1000 representatives of local government and civil society are trained in the relevant fields by the 6 regional resource centers.*

- over 2,500 people have gone through various trainings at the 6 regional resource centers.

### Main achievements of 2009:

#### Activity 1:

- We've provided assistance to the government with drafting the law on Free Legal Aid. The law has been discussed twice on UNDP-organized round tables and input was drawn from all potential stakeholders. At the moment the draft law is being prepared by the National Human Rights Center for submission to the Cabinet of Ministers.
- A needs assessment mission for the Federation of Societies of Consumer Rights Protection and Anti-Monopoly Committee was conducted with participation of an international expert. Main areas of possible UNDP intervention have been identified and starting from 2010 we plan to begin our joint activities with the FSCR and AMC on consumer rights protection issues.

- Another needs assessment mission was conducted for the Office of the Authorized Person of Oliy Majlis on Human Rights (Ombudsman). This mission was cost shared with the Bratislava Regional Office within their regional program of supporting national human rights institutions in CIS and Eastern Europe. The report from the international consultant is expected at the end of December.
- A large number of books have been ordered by the project for distribution among our main counterparts as procurement with legal literature has been one of the main requests consistently made by all our national partners.

#### Activity 2:

- 96 students have successfully graduated from the UNDP-support clinics in 2009.
- 210 students are currently studying at all 5 clinics around the country; almost half of them (101) are newcomers who came in this fall. 635 cases were taken by all clinics from all areas of law.
- Our project emphasizes networking among all UNDP-supported clinics and we've assisted in conducting several events during the past year that have contributed towards that idea, such as the Summer school, inter-clinical moot court competition on civil procedure and a student scientific conference dedicated to the International Human Rights Day.
- Project has helped the clinics by providing them with some office equipment, supplies, Norma legal database, and internet, methodological and training assistance.
- Project has tried to foster working relationships and promote synergy with other UNDP projects, such as CEDAW and Business Forum of Uzbekistan. Personnel from those projects have provided trainings for clinics in Tashkent and Nukus on arbitration courts and women's rights. We plan to continue collaborating with the BF project next year.
- A number of PR activities have been organized to introduce the population with the work of clinics. With the help of G.Saidazimova we've organized a study tour to UWED clinic for representatives of several mass media outlets and as a result 3 articles were published in national newspapers. In total 10 articles about legal clinics were published in various local and national newspapers and 2 TV programs aired on local television.

#### Activity 3:

- After 3 years of administering the IATP program for IREX, UNDP finally has taken full control over the 6 regional resource centers.
- More than 35,000 people have visited the resource centers during 2009.
- Over 180 volunteers have assisted our regional administrators to attract those people to the centers and provide them with various services.
- Synergy with other UNDP projects – with ICTP and ACCESS to teach computer skills to the disabled. With CEDAW we've trained more than 50 representatives of various mass media outlets in Tashkent and other regions how to use web 2.0 technologies.
- Trainings – through our regional centers we've offered wide range of trainings for local population and most of them were led by our volunteers. For instance, online distance learning courses on office management for the disabled, computer trainings for hearing impaired youth, mobile trainings during cotton picking season, etc.

- In September project has provided NORMA legal database to every regional center. Few local lawyers and accountants have volunteered to teach their peers how to use the database to find up to date legislation and sample documents.

### Targets 2010

1. At least 700 representatives of law-enforcement, judges and lawyers are trained at human rights courses introduced at main specialized training centers (Lawyers' Training Center, Prosecutor's Training Courses, Academy of the Ministry of the Interior);
2. Law on Free Legal Aid is adopted; all legal clinics are fully operational -
3. At least 3000 people are trained on human rights and legal awareness issues under the 6 regional centers.

### Activity 1:

- Project plans to assist in organizing trainings with the Ministry of Internal Affairs, Legal Training Center under MoJ and Chamber of Advocates on CAT, administrative justice, other area of substantive law and legal skills.
- Project continues working with the Ombuds office and plan to take that cooperation to a more systematic level. One of the areas of assistance - setting up a penitentiary ombudsman. Another - trainings on treaty-reporting and complaints handling.
- Project plans to start working with the Federation of Societies for Consumer Rights Protection and Anti-Monopoly Committee on improving the capacity of the Federation through trainings of their staff. With collaboration from the ICTP project we plan to develop a web portal entirely dedicated to the issue of consumer protection.
- Project plans to emphasize public outreach through social advertising, tv and radio announcements. We plan to collaborate with the Ministry of Internal Affairs, Anti-Monopoly Committee and FSCRCP.
- In legal research – we plan to assist the government with preparing an analytical report on implementation of habeas corpus and to finish work on the publication developed by the CEDAW project "Women's Rights in Questions and Answers".
- Hiring of a part-time Project Associate.

### Activity 2:

- Training on consulting skills development for NamSU LC students.
- 2 trainings on interview and consulting skills development for KSU LC students.
- Signing of MoU with 4 Universities and 1 NGO under which LCs are functioning.
- LC Open Ceremony in Nukus and Namangan cities.
- TOT for trainers of LCs of Uzbekistan.

- 2 trainings on treaty courts for regional LCs Project and commercial moot court competition among legal clinics in cooperation with Business Forum of Uzbekistan.
- Publication of special bulletin on clinical legal education in Uzbekistan
- Study tour to Czech Republic
- Summer School on civil procedure
- Inter-clinical civil moot court competition
- Transfer of stationery sets and updates of Norma legal data base for LCs
- Inter-clinical students' scientific conference
- SSA contracts signing with 8 tutors and trainers of LCs.

### Activity 3:

Next year we intend to carry out several subprojects, including the Tech Age Girls, ecological marathons, gender and development, SMS technologies and charity events with the help of volunteer coordinators to be hired by January. The councils of volunteers, to be launched on the base of the internet centers, will draw new volunteers and coordinate their activities. Along the line, we intend to continue our work with other UNDP projects and teach their beneficiaries ICT skills.